

SONORAN DESERT CONSERVATION PLAN STEERING COMMITTEE

EDUCATION SESSION #3

July 24, 1999 (9:00 - 11:30 a.m.)
Arizona-Sonora Desert Museum (Gallery)
2021 N. Kinney Road /
Tucson, Arizona, 85743

PIMA COUNTY'S PEOPLE, ECONOMY, WATER AND LAND

Pima County's Economy
Marshall Vest

COMMENTS: SHARON BRONSON:

If you have any questions for Mr. Taylor, I will entertain them now. I told he you he would be entertaining. I would like to put Mr. Taylor on the Board of Supervisors agenda for August 3, 1999, when we formally adopt the budget. Here are a couple statistics for you. Pima County has the highest property tax rate of all 15 counties in Arizona, that's the bad news. The good news though is that of the 15 counties we are tenth, we are at the bottom one-third in what we tax total per capita. So the taxes you pay as individuals are less than they are in nine other counties so that is the good news since taxes are never good news.

Okay, let us talk a little bit more about the economy and I am really pleased now to be introducing Marshall Vest. He is the forecasting project director of the University of Arizona's College of Business and Public Administration. He is a contributor to the Blue Chip newsletter focusing on Arizona's economy. He is an authority on Arizona's economy, he consults with Arizona's largest companies and his forecasts are one of the most Business Economists (NABE) and is past president of the Arizona Chapter. He has taught courses in environmental management, economic forecasting and is a consultant in the fields of urban planning and economic development. As we deal with the economics of the Sonoran Desert Conservation Plan, here is somebody whose information will be very informative.

PIMA COUNTY'S ECONOMY: MARSHALL VEST

It is my pleasure to be here this morning. Driving out here this morning was really remarkable, I think I have spent every free night coming out here and it is more extraordinary. As I came over the Gates Pass area, I could see all the way across the valley all the way to Kitt Peak.

Now, I brought along a laptop and we had a few technical problems this morning so I am not going to be able to stand here, I am going to have to stand back where the machine is and talk as we go through the slides.

Along the way, I am going to ask some questions. I am going to talk a little bit about how Tucson has grown and industries that are here. I ask the question: How is Tucson likely to fare as we move into the new millennium? I will talk just a little bit about Tucson's economy so that is where I would like to begin. How many of you saw Ken Burn's series on PBS about three years ago called "The West." It was a wonderful series that told the story of how the west was settled and the recurring theme is that the west is a land of possibilities. The place where men made a stand and the story that they told went all the way back to the early 1800's in the time of the mountain men, trekking out to the Rocky Mountains. Wave after wave of migrants came into this part of the country, again, to the land of possibilities.

Slide: Arizona is Consistently One of the Fastest Growing States (Population)

Period Rank Top 5 States

1900 - 95 2 NV, **AZ**, FL, CA, WA
1900 - 10 7 WA, OK, ID, NV, ND
1910 - 20 1 **AZ**, CA, MT, WY, DC
1920 - 30 4 CA, FL, MI, **AZ**, NJ
1930 - 40 7 DC, FL, NM, NV, CA
1940 - 50 2 CA, **AZ**, FL, NV, OR
1950 - 60 4 FL, NV, AK, **AZ**, CA
1960 - 70 3 NV, FL, **AZ**, AK, CA
1970 - 80 2 NV, **AZ**, FL, WY, UT
1980 - 90 3 NV, AK, **AZ**, FL, CA
1990 - 95 3 NV, ID, **AZ**, CO, UT

Arizona has consistently been one of the fastest growing states in the nation as far as population. Over the first 95 years and of this decade, Arizona ranks as the second fastest growing state which includes Nevada, Arizona, Florida, California and the State of Washington. Admittedly, there were not very many people back here at the turn of the century about 1900. There was something on the order of 130,000 people. What is surprising is that if you look at any decade in this

century you will find that Arizona is consistently ranked among the top five with the exception of a couple of decades. The first exception is the 1900 to 1910, Arizona was ranked number 7, and the next decade where they were ranked number 7 was the decade between 1930 and 1940. As we get down to the first five years of this decade, Arizona was ranked third after Nevada and Idaho followed by Colorado and Utah.

Well there can be no question that Arizona is a growth state. By the way, what is the state bird in Arizona?

Answer: Cactus Wren.

I thought it was the "construction crane." Snowbirds is another bird that could qualify as a state bird but what a state it is!

It's time for a quiz here? I know it is Saturday morning and everything but let's do this, this is your chance for a little audience participation and everybody has a chance to vote here.

Q.How many metropolitan areas does Arizona have?

Let's have by a show of hands, how many would say two? We have three hands.

How about three metropolitan areas? Four hands.

How about four? Even more.

Five metropolitan areas?

How about six?

Seven or more metropolitan areas?

Well let's take a look at the map. When I moved here, there were only two metropolitan areas which were Maricopa County for the Phoenix area and Pima County which is the Tucson Metro area. Just a few years ago, Pinal County was lumped in with Maricopa to redefine the Metro Phoenix area, they even gave it a new name. It is called Phoenix-Mesa Metropolitan area and they did that because of the commuting patterns there on the eastward bound freeway of the Phoenix Metro area. Just a couple of years ago, Yuma became a metropolitan area. More recently, Flagstaff in Coconino County along with Kanab County in Utah, and I am still trying to figure out what Kanab County, Utah, is doing in that designation. So we have the Flagstaff Metro area and then, somebody thought that Mohave County should be lumped in along with Clark County, Nevada, which is the Las Vegas Metropolitan area. Take a good look at the map which has 15 counties and out of these 15 counties, six of them are now officially designated as being a metropolitan area. Those of you who voted for five, you get an "A." You do not want to think about this too hard, the entire stretch of the Grand Canyon National Park is entirely designated as a metropolitan area. People who do this, by the way, are back in Washington D.C.

Slide: **ARIZONA FACTOIDS**

Arizona is one of the most highly urbanized states in the nation
87.5% of population lives in an urban area
Arizona ranks 5th, behind CA, NJ, HI, NV

David touched on this that Arizona is one of the most highly urbanized states in the nation at 87.5% of the population as of 1990 lives in an urban area. Arizona is ranked 5th behind California, New Jersey, Hawaii and Nevada.

Slide: **ARIZONA FACTOIDS**

Arizona is 21st largest state
now larger than Colorado
4.8 million versus 4.0 million people

Arizona has 2
(about 1.7 million each)

Today Arizona is the 21st largest state and as of 1990, Arizona surpassed Colorado by about 4.8 million, almost five million people here in Arizona today versus right at four million in the State of Colorado. Arizona has about two and a half times the number of people as New Mexico or Nevada and each of those states has about 1.7 million people.

Slide: **25-Year Projections - Tucson**

1995 2000 2020

Population (000)	758	849	1,225
Nonag Jobs (000)	303	351	587
Personal Inc.(\$bil)	14.8	20.9	72.4
Retail Sales (\$bil)	6.3	8.2	24.0

Well here are the projections. These are figures and models that I have used over the years to help me forecast where things are going. So our most recent forecast and one you can read about in Arizona's Economy is that the Tucson Metro area and Pima County, the population is going to grow from right at 848,000 or 850,000 today to almost one and a quarter million people by the year 2020. You notice that jobs are almost going to double between 1995 through the year 2020 and we will get nearly one-half of the population and then you see some tremendous increases in personal income as you go towards 2020.

Slide: **OUTLOOK SUMMARY METRO AREAS**

PHX TUS

Population gain by 2004 (000s) 435 91
Per year

New housing units per yr (000s) 34.5 7.5

Year 2020 population (mil) 5.04 1.22

David and I change numbers every now and then. Back in 1960, the total population ratio in Tucson was about 25% and the projection is that we have here in the year 2020, we will have right at one-half in Tucson. The Metro Phoenix has a higher ratio and they will probably be up around 35%. Statewide, the numbers for the Nonag jobs were very good but the County numbers. (Inaudible from this point)

Q:What kind of jobs are we going to have?

A:I will try to answer that question as we go along.

Q:Why are the retail sales growing along with the population?

A:Retail sales is one billion dollars. As we move forward retail sales is going to comprise less of our purchasing and we will be purchasing more and more services.

Let me talk about the Metro areas and compare Phoenix and Tucson. There will be a population gain by the year 2004 and that is just five years from now. We are going to see an increase in the Tucson area at 90,000 or so and over a decade we will add almost 200,000. During the decade of the 1990's the population is going to grow by 200,000 people. During the past five years Tucson has added a city about one and a half times the size of Flagstaff, about one and a half times the size of Yuma and about two and a half times the size of Sierra Vista. The amazing thing is that over that same period time, the Metro Phoenix area has added a city the size of the City of Tucson, just five years ago. You will also notice the number of new housing units per year on average over the next five years, we are going to have to build somewhere between 7,000 and 8,000 housing units. That does not include the trailers, mobile homes or manufactured homes. The manufactured home shipments are consistently 2,000-3,000 units per year.

Slide: The Phoenix "Citistate"

Def:A regional economy with a major city at its center

Metro Phoenix is a "mega city"

3 million population

THE city of the southwest

Commercial and financial center

We need to talk a little bit about how Tucson fits into the region and I hear some nervous laughter in here. Phoenix really is what might be called a "Citistate." The definition of a "Citistate" is that it is a regional economy with a major city at its center. The Phoenix Metro area has about 3 million people today and it is clearly THE city of the southwest. It is the commercial and financial center, it has the most highly diversified areas of any metro area. It has 7th busiest airport in the nation at Sky Harbor, it is now the regional office of Charles Schwab and it is the back office operations center for credit card processing, data processing center, they Mayo Clinic is located there. It is the headquarters for many national corporations, home of major businesses like Motorola, Intel, Allied Signal, Honeywell, American Express, Boeing, TRW, Microchip Technology, Insight Computers, America West or Southwest Airlines and there are many other major companies located there. For pro sports fans, there is football, basketball, baseball and ice hockey.

Slide: The Phoenix "Citistate"

Similar to Atlanta

Serves entire state of Georgia and more
Savannah is its port city

Phoenix is center of the southwest

Tucson, Flagstaff, Yuma, Sierra Vista are all satellites of Phoenix

Outlying areas have lost political power

So you can think of Phoenix in a manner similar to that of Atlanta. Now Atlanta serves the entire State of Georgia and more and Savannah is its port city. Phoenix really is the center of the southwest. Tucson, Flagstaff, Yuma, Sierra Vista are all satellites of the Phoenix area. Those financial decisions now made in Phoenix. Many flights that originate in Tucson have to go to Phoenix and for the past few years, Tucson has seen its political power in the State Legislature slowly but surely diminish. Now why is this important to Tucson?

Slide: Phoenix is the Engine for Growth for this Region

Advantages of locating in Phoenix

Low air freight costs
Large skilled labor force
Strong ties to higher education
Adequate water supplies
Lower property taxes
Leadership to solve problems
Better connections to Internet - high band width

There are many advantages for locating in Phoenix. There are lower air freight costs, large skilled labor force, strong ties to higher education, adequate water supplies, there is no question about the water in that area. It has a much lower property tax and it appears to have leadership both in the public and private sector and finally, it has much better connections to the Internet due to its high band width. I still cannot get DSL at my house. Phoenix today is one of the best connected large Internet cities. It also has satellite.

Implications of Membership in the Phoenix Citistate

We need to recognize the indivisibility of the Citistate
Understand where the region is headed
Identify how Tucson fits into the whole
Accept the limitations on what Tucson can become

We like to think we are in control of our own destiny and we sure do not want to be left out but we need to realize that we are far from being a citistate and that does place some limitations on what Tucson can become.

Now the question is: Is Arizona getting better or are we just getting bigger?

Dave mentioned that two years ago the center of the budget policy priorities were crime which were very sobering statistics about what this state stands for.

Slide: THE POOR ARE GETTING POORER

Arizona has the 4th-widest gap Income Gap
Arizona has fastest Income Gap
Real incomes are declining for 80% of families with children

Arizona has the fourth widest income gap in the country and the gap is growing wider and faster than any other state. If you look at the data behind this, you will see the real incomes are declining to about 80% of the steady population, the steady population is families with children.

Pie Chart Slide:

Again, if you take the income history by Quintiles and you compare that distribution from the mid-80's and the mid-90's, being careful, of course, to adjust for inflation you find then that real income, inflation adjusted income has declined for the bottom one-fifth, you find by 37% here in Arizona and that is the largest decline of any state in the country. You see it also decline next to the bottom and the middle and the next to the top. It is not until you get the top one-fifth of income distribution do you see any gain and then it is minuscule 3%, one of the smallest increases of any state.

Q:What is the income of the top one-fifth and the bottom one-fifth?

A:Okay, take the income distribution of families with children and just divide it up into five pieces.

I don't think I have the numbers with me that delineates where the breaks are and it is not in the report of Arizona's Economy which was recently published. It is the number of families in the bottom one-fifth of the income distribution and the cutoff, of course we have to adjust for inflation, I am thinking that break between the top and bottom is somewhere in the range of \$15,000.00 but again, I do not know what you are using to inflate these numbers with, where that index is that really changes how high that is. That is a good question, I am sorry I did not have a good answer or the numbers with me. Hopefully the families that are on the bottom one-fifth in the mid-80's have moved up and have bettered themselves. The implication is, whoever those people, those people have less purchasing power today than what they had a decade ago.

Okay, so we have this crusty old character. As Dave mentioned, we have been fighting the war on poverty here for so long that some of the oldtimer's now are starting to win. It is a little known fact that I once worked for the City of Tucson when Mayor Murphy was in office. He said, "I understand you have been fighting the war on poverty." I said, "That is right." He asked, "How come I am still poor?" I said, "Well, you lost." He then asked, "Are you taking any prisoners?"

The real question here is: Why is poverty rate so high? There was an article in last week's Wall Street Journal that talks about why some part of the country are chronically poor. Well,

are we all going to wind up on the street corner in this fashion trying to support our retirement? Hopefully not and as long as we make good decisions and continue to grow the economy, we may be able to address some of these issues.

Slide: HOW DOES CORPORATE AMERICA VIEW TUCSON?

Tourism, Mining, Aviation & missiles (aerospace)
Astronomy & optics

If you look at the economic table all around the country, this is what I understand from them. Corporate America views Tucson for tourism and mining. They also think of Tucson is also an area that is known for aviation and missiles, aerospace like Allied Signal and Raytheon. They also think of Tucson for its astronomy and optics like Kitt Peak Observatory, Mt. Graham Observatory and of course in the past decade or so, Tucson has been dubbed the "Tucson Optics Valley."

Slide: TUCSON'S STRATEGIC VISION

The gateway to Latin America
Strong cultural ties to Mexico
Located on I-10, with Texas to East and California to West
Deep sea port of Guaymas
Need a multi-modal facility
Rail, trucking air
Transportation improvements
Optics Valley?

Our strategic vision: Are we the gateway to Latin America? Are we the port to areas in the south? We have strong cultural ties, we are located on I-10 with Texas to the east and California to the west and the possibility of a deep sea port developed in Guaymas. We do have a need for a multi-modal facility here that would handle rail, trucking and air and we will need to improve all of our transportation systems. And of course, the Optics Valley.

Slide: EXPORT-BASED INDUSTRIES

Industries that produce and sell goods to markets **outside the local economy**

Money flows into the local economy and recirculates, producing a "multiplier" effect

Can a service providing sector be export based?

We need to define what we mean by export-based industries. This is really a part of the growth of the economy. We need to grow our export base to industries that produces and sells goods to markets outside of the local economy. In return, money flows into the economy and recirculates thereby producing a "multiplier" effect, everybody wins.

Slide: TUCSON'S LEADING EXPORT-BASED INDUSTRIES

Tourism

High Technology

University of Arizona

Military installations

Davis Monthan Air Force Base and Air National Guard

Copper mining

Teleservices and telemarketing are activities that have located in the community here recently and they also are part of the export base. In fact, growth in telemarketing has probably done more to raise the minimum wage than anything. What is Tucson's leading export based industries? First and foremost are tourists, high technology. Let me give you some information on tourism. In 1996, 2.5 million visitors came to the Old Pueblo and 1.5 million dollars was spent creating close to 36,500 jobs. You can see all the multiplier effects, you see that tourism accounts for about 12% of the local economy. High technology, again about 12% and we are talking now about electronics, computers, aircraft missiles, software, the University of Arizona with the research they are conducting. The military creates about 8,000 jobs at Davis Monthan, the Air National Guard. It is just an aside that Arizona has Luke Marina Air Corp Station, Fort Huachuca, Gila Bend Auxiliary Air Field, Western Army Aviation Training Facility and of course, the Barry Goldwater Gunnery Range. If the Barry Goldwater Gunnery Range did not exist, there would be no reason to have any of those military installations present with the exception of Fort Huachuca. And then finally, the copper mining industry is no longer paying a portion that drives the economy.

Q:What are the wages paid by the military?

A:The wages involved are much less.

The effect is equal with the military installations because there are those who spend their money to have their hair done, at the local Circle K and other business establishments located near the military installations.

Slide: TUCSON'S INDUSTRY CLUSTERS

Aerospace

Optics

Environmental Technologies

BioIndustry

Software

Teleservices

Plastics

If we look at Tucson's industry clusters, these are the industries that are economic developers and they are trying to support the local recruitment and retention.

Q:Inaudible

The retirement issue is an important component and we have not found a study of retirement in Tucson. The industry cluster including aerospace, optics, environmental technologies, BioIndustry, software, Teleservices and plastics are the industries that tend to be high tech and they tend to be the kinds of things that work very well here in the Tucson. There are low demands on the environment and of course, all of these industries tend to be export based. That is the important part, we need to develop the export base in order to create those economic opportunities for existing residents and for the community to gain wealth. All of these industries are knowledge based, they fit very well into the new economy.

**Slide: MILKEN INSTITUTE TECH-POLES
Western Region**

<http://milken-inst.org/mod30/summary.html>

Rank City # Rank City #

1 San Jose, CA 10 19 Denver, CO 3
3 LA-Long Beach 5 22 San Francisco, CA 5
5 Seattle-Bell.-Ever. 6 24 Boise City, ID 2
7 Albuquerque, NM 3 26 Portland-Vancouver 2
12 Phoenix-Mesa, AZ 1 27 Boulder-Longmont 9
13 Orange County, CA 10 37 Sacramento, CA 6
14 Oakland, CA 8 40 Tucson, AZ 5
17 San Diego, CA 9 42 Colorado Springs, CO 9

is the number of industries with concentration (LQs > 1)

Two studies came out just within the past week and these are fairly new so I hope the Internet address shows clearly. I placed the Internet address on the screen so if anyone wishes to download these new studies. I think they are very good from an economical development standpoint in asking questions of high technology: How are we doing? This study from the Milken Institute rates the cities according to an index they developed for high technology and I have just shown the cities in the western region here so we skip over to San Jose, Los Angeles, Long Beach and so forth. San Jose has 10 different industries where they have a concentration of some of these that they are output and location situations if you will. The location quotient is greater than 1 if you have a concentration of industries above the nationwide average. So San Jose is 10, Phoenix is in the 12th spot, interestingly with only one industry. And then we have Tucson at 40 and #5, tech-poles is the study we are referring to. I am going to finish here in about three minutes or so, I am almost to the end.

Slide: **STATE "NEW ECONOMY INDEX"**
Progressive Policy Institute

<http://207.158.143/states/summary.html>

OVERALL RANK

California 2
Colorado 3
Washington 4
Utah 6
Arizona 10
Oregon 15
New Mexico 19
Nevada 21
Idaho 23
Wyoming 41
Montana 46

A second policy of Progressive Policy Institute has a different address for you to look at, they have created a new economy index which is intended to capture how well states are geared up to the new economy in the information age. California ranks number 2, to Colorado, Washington, Utah and Arizona in there in the 10th spot. Again, this is just western states.

Slide: **STATE "NEW ECONOMY INDEX," AZ**
Progressive Policy Institute

<http://207.158.225.143/states/summary.html>

RANK

Overall ranking 10
"Gazelle Jobs" 3
Commercial Internet Domains 4
Job Churning 5
Export Focus in Manuf. 9
Educated Workforce 12
High Tech Jobs 12
Venture Capital 13
Digital Government 13
Online Population 14
Patents 16

Now for Arizona, this chart gives you an idea of some of the measures they use for attaining the overall ranking of number 10. They had this index for "Gazelle Jobs," that is the percentage of firms that have growth rates in excess of 20% over a four year period, it is random growth which is the idea here. Arizona ranks number 4 as far as far as Commercial Internet Domains and I am surprised at that ranking. Job churning, this is the birth and death of companies of which Arizona ranks 5th. We also have export focus in manufacturing where

we export a lot of more than we produce. The educated workforce ranked number 12, an issue that David was talking about where we have low rankings as far as educational attainment and considering the dropout rate, I was surprised to see educated workforce as high as number 12. High tech jobs, venture capital, digital government, the authors think we are well on our way to transforming our government, the governmental agencies are getting into the information age. Online population, we are ranked number 14 and the number of patents, we are ranked number 16 so there are some recommendations that have come out of these studies.

ACTION ITEMS

- Recognize the indivisibility of the citistate
- Make governance work
- Solve the water issues now
- Social deprivation and workforce preparedness
- Make education and workforce training our number one priority
- Implement strategic plan for ED

Here is a direct quote:

Slide: **IN THE NEW ECONOMY**

"Economic success will increasingly be determined by how effectively an area can spur technological innovation, entrepreneurship, education, specialized skills, and the transition of all organization - public and private - from bureaucratic hierarchies to learning networks."

We get the learning networks, that is what these industry clusters are all about, us bringing together the companies and those industries so that they can network and learn from one another.

Slide: **POLICY PRESCRIPTIONS FOR THE "NEW ECONOMY"**

- Co-invest in the skills of the network
- Co-invest in an infrastructure for innovation
- Promote innovation-oriented and customer-oriented government
- Foster the transformation to a digital economy
- Foster civic collaboration

As for policy prescriptions, I thought these were interesting. Policy prescriptions for the new economy. We have to invest in the skills of the workforce, we already know that because we do not do a very good job yet but we will though. Invest in infrastructure for innovation, technology transfer those kinds of things. We need to promote innovation-oriented and customer-oriented government, foster the transformation to a digital economy and get U.S. West Communications and others to invest some of their money locally. Finally, foster civic collaboration. I will leave you with this cartoon, Toles is one of my favorite cartoonists and here Toles is telling us that an economist is trying to follow the flight of the butterfly and the butterfly is not able to come down. What you might not be able to read is the subtitle down there. It says, "Better stick to color commentary." So just to wrap up, I think Tucson does

have a future that is clear that Tucson is going to grow but there is the question of, what will it look like when we get there. I am optimistic that we will make the right decisions and continue to make Tucson a little place and continue to develop the economy that the food will be right there amongst the more prosperous metropolitan areas in this new digital economy. Thanks a bunch.

Q:Do we need a sales tax?

A:I will give you an economic development answer: From an economic development perspective, our sales tax, what is important is not to have a particular tax that sticks out when compared to other areas, other cities that you are competing with. A sales tax as presently in Tucson is lower than the Metropolitan Phoenix area so a quarter percent sales tax does not burden our ability to recruit new companies to this area. The property tax on the other hand is already very high and does definitely harm the ability to lure companies into town.

Q:What do we know about attracting businesses into Tucson?

A:Attractiveness is becoming more and more important as we move into this digital age. Geographic boundaries are disappearing and it does not really matter what part of the country you are in anymore. You are going to be close to raw materials, you do not have to have the lowest property tax rate but you have to have an environment where science and the engineers like to live. Tucson can get better connected to the outside world and develop that high tech look. The environment is one of the things along with education which I believe is the key. We have got to be better at education.

Thanks a lot.

COMMENTS: SHARON BRONSON

Again, I want to add a few more statistics for you. As we looked at what our leading industries were here in Southern Arizona, you are going to know that Davis Monthan was up there, the military, the University of Arizona, government and the reality is and one of the reasons your property taxes are so high is that much of what drives our economy and where the jobs are, are in fact, institutions that do not contribute to the property tax base. That is one of the reasons we are so uncompetitive and so \$1.64 or \$1.65 of the combined rate whereas some are now \$5.25. One of those reasons is that we do not have that high assessed valuation. Phoenix has over three times the population and five times the assessed valuation. We have 328,000 people in unincorporated Pima County and in incorporated Maricopa County, we are one-half that at 160,000 plus people and the way we fund government, the way we fund cities and they get more revenues than counties. Counties have two sources of revenue generators and one is a sales tax which Pima County does not have and the other is property tax, we get less in shared revenues when we get our Highway Revenue Funds. We do not get any at all from income tax because the city is getting income tax distribution from the State of Arizona so as we look to how we are going to develop the Sonoran Desert Conservation Plan and how we are going to fund it, I think those are important facts that you have. You might want to thank whoever mentioned the fact that well over 41% of our economy is coming from where we generate the money. We are going to take about a ten minute break now and then come back to Mr. McNulty and Pima County's Principal Planner, Mr. Frank Behlau.

